Presently, it is not known whether the association has causal relationships. In addition, our method does have some shortcomings (e.g., possibility of selection bias), although we utilized a fairly large sample size, with the finding being stable on different statistics. However, correlation of calcemia level with risperidone dose and literature data probably justifies additional research of possible causality. Risperidone, as well as other antipsychotics, can induce hyperprolactinemia and hypogonadism (2), synthesis of calcium binding proteins in the tissues (3), and changes in calcium-dependent signaling pathways (4), which could cause a calcium-depleted state and/or trigger calcium redistribution within body compartments. Individuals treated with antipsychotics have small but variable risks of hip fracture (5). With additional risks, even small disturbances of calcium homeostasis could make this population prone to osteoporosis and increase the probability of fractures.

### References

- Zornic N, Radojevic DJ, Jankovic S, Djuric D, Varjacic M, Simic VD, Milovanovic DR: Monitoring of drug-associated electrolyte disturbances in a hospital. Pharmacoepidemiol Drug Saf 2009; 18:1026–1033
- Kishimoto T, Watanabe K, Shimada N, Makita K, Yagi G, Kashima H: Antipsychotic-induced hyperprolactinemia inhibits the hypothalamo-pituitary-gonadal axis and reduces bone mineral density in male patients with schizophrenia. J Clin Psychiatry 2008; 69:385–391
- 3. Quincozes-Santos A, Abib RT, Leite MC, Bobermin D, Bambini-Junior V, Gonçalves CA, Riesgo R, Gottfried C: Effect of the atypical neuroleptic risperidone on morphology and S100B secretion in C6 astroglial lineage cells. Mol Cell Biochem 2008; 314:59–63
- Rushlow WJ, Seah C, Sutton LP, Bjelica A, Rajakumar N: Antipsychotics affect multiple calcium calmodulin dependent proteins. Neuroscience 2009; 161:877–886
- Liperoti R, Onder G, Lapane KL, Mor V, Friedman JH, Bernabei R, Gambassi G: Conventional or atypical antipsychotics and the risk of femur fracture among elderly patients: results of a casecontrol study. J Clin Psychiatry 2007; 68: 929–934

DRAGAN R. MILOVANOVIC, M.D., PH.D. VLADIMIR JANJIC, M.D., M.Sc. NENAD ZORNIC, M.D., M.Sc. SLAVICA DJUKIC DEJANOVIC, M.D., PH.D. SLOBODAN M. JANKOVIC, M.D., PH.D. *Kragujevac, Serbia* 

The authors report no financial relationships with commercial interests.

The authors thank V. Janjic, N. Zornic, and their associates for collecting study data.

*This letter (doi: 10.1176/appi.ajp.2010.10071003) was accepted for publication in September 2010.* 

# Melancholia as a Distinct Mood Disorder? Recommendations for DSM-5

To THE EDITOR: In an editorial in the July 2010 issue of the *Journal*, Gordon Parker, M.D. (1), and a distinguished group of 16 coauthors, including one of the Deputy Editors of this journal, made an argument for melancholia being classified as a distinct mood disorder. The arguments that 1) melancholia features a cluster of symptoms with greater consistency

than the broad heterogeneity of the disorders and conditions included in major depression and bipolar disorder and 2) the melancholia diagnosis has superior predictability for prognosis and treatment were not well supported by the evidence. For example, the statement that melancholic patients rarely respond to placebos, psychotherapies, or social interventions could equally well apply to severe major depression and psychotic major depression, both of which are major depression subtypes, as is melancholia, allowed as "specifiers" in the DSM-IV classification of major depression. Relevant literature reveals that hypercortisolemia is not specific to the melancholia diagnosis (2, 3). More importantly, in many studies the melancholia diagnosis lacks predictive value for treatment selection, including response to antidepressant medications or differential predictive value for response across classes of antidepressants (4, 5). Because each of the specifiers designated in DSM-IV shares characteristics with the larger domain of major depression and yet each has its own distinctive qualities (for melancholia it is a characteristic cluster of symptoms), it makes sense to retain the current system in DSM-5.

## References

- Parker G, Fink M, Shorter E, Taylor MA, Akiskal H, Berrios G, Bolwig T, Brown WA, Carroll B, Healy D, Klein DF, Koukopoulos A, Michels R, Paris J, Rubin RT, Spitzer R, Swartz C: Issues for DSM-5: Whither melancholia? The case for its classification as a mood disorder. Am J Psychiatry 2010; 167:745–747
- Stokes PE, Stoll PM, Koslow SH, Maas JW, Davis JM, Swann AC, Robins E: Pretreatment DST and hypothalamic-pituitaryadrenocortical function in depressed patients and comparison groups: a multicenter study. Arch Gen Psychiatry 1984; 41:257–267
- American Psychiatric Association Task Force on Laboratory Tests in Psychiatry: The Dexamethasone Suppression Test: an overview of its current status in psychiatry. Am J Psychiatry 1987; 144:1253–1262
- 4. Hirschfeld RM: Efficacy of SSRIs and newer antidepressants in severe depression: comparison with TCAs. J Clin Psychiatry 1999; 60:326–335
- Mallinckrodt CH, Watkin JG, Liu C, Wohlreich MM, Raskin J: Duloxetine in the treatment of major depressive disorder: a comparison of efficacy in patients with and without melancholic features. BMC Psychiatry 2005; 5:1

#### JAMES H. KOCSIS, M.D. New York, N.Y.

Dr. Kocsis has received research grant support from the Agency for Healthcare Research and Quality, the National Institute of Mental Health, the National Institute on Drug Abuse, AstraZeneca, Burroughs Wellcome Trust, CNS Response, Forest, Pritzker Consortium, and Roche; he has served on the speaker's bureaus of AstraZeneca, Merck, Pfizer, and Wyeth; and he has served on the advisory boards of Neurosearch, Pfizer, and Wyeth.

*This letter (doi: 10.1176/appi.ajp.2010.10070983) was accepted for publication in September 2010.* 

## **Reply to Kocsis Letter**

To THE EDITOR: Dr. Kocsis urges that DSM-5 should retain the status quo of melancholia as a specifier for major depressive disorder, whereas we recommended, based on much evidence (1, 2), that melancholia be positioned as a distinct mood disorder.