

It has been fully operational and reliable since 1995, and we have processed data up until 2002: 81,466 admissions in psychiatric units were recorded, with 12,919 receiving a diagnosis of personality disorder at discharge. The yearly total of borderline personality disorder diagnoses as a percentage of the total number of personality disorder diagnoses was as follows: 10.03% (1995), 10.27% (1996), 13.83% (1997), 16.22% (1998), 21.41% (1999), 17.18% (2000), 17.67% (2001), and 17.56% (2002). On the other hand, histrionic personality disorder accounted for the following percentages of all personality disorders: 25.75% (1995), 29.46% (1996), 16.98% (1997), 20.52% (1998), 16.78% (1999), 17.88% (2000), 17.96% (2001), and 19.17% (2002). The percentage of borderline personality disorder increased significantly over the first part of the period under study, whereas the percentage of histrionic personality disorder decreased over the same time period until the final years of the study when both percentages stabilized (the graphic representation of these percentages is nearly symmetrical around the x axis).

The sum of borderline personality disorder diagnoses plus histrionic personality disorder as a percentage of the total number of personality disorder diagnoses changed little over time: 35.78% (1995), 39.72% (1996), 30.80% (1997), 36.74% (1998), 38.18% (1999), 35.06% (2000), 35.06% (2001), and 36.72% (2002). Therefore, it is not at all unreasonable to think that a situation of "diagnostic transfer" has taken place over this period of time, moving from histrionic to borderline personality disorder.

One of the keys to this finding was provided by the results of Blashfield and Intoccia's brief report (4): the amount of literature on borderline personality disorder has experienced striking growth since the 1980s (after DSM-III), whereas the literature on histrionic personality disorder has declined since the mid-1970s. This situation has consequently influenced the practice of clinicians, including those in European countries.

New elements and conclusions can also be drawn from the excellent study by Drs. Shedler and Westen (1): On one hand, as the authors interpreted the data, clinicians may not have clearly differentiated conceptions of the two personality disorders, leading them to be confused because of their high level of comorbidity, or, on the other hand, current diagnostic classifications should perhaps not maintain their current distinction between borderline and histrionic personality disorder.

References

1. Shedler J, Westen D: Refining personality disorder diagnosis: integrating science and practice. *Am J Psychiatry* 2004; 161: 1350–1365
2. Andalusian Statistics Institute (SIMA): Sistema de Información Multiterritorial de Andalucía. Seville, Spain, Consejería de Economía y Hacienda, 2003. <http://www.juntadeandalucia.es/institutodeestadistica/sima/>
3. Minimum Basic Data Set at Discharge From Hospitals (MBDS). Seville, Spain, Director General Asistencia Sanitaria, Servicio Andaluz Salud, 2004. <http://www.juntadeandalucia.es/servicioandaluzdesalud/publicaciones/listado.asp?mater=9>
4. Blashfield RK, Intoccia V: Growth of the literature on the topic of personality disorders. *Am J Psychiatry* 2000; 157:472–473

J. MIGUEL PENA-ANDREU, M.D., PH.D.
ANDRES FONTALBA, M.D.
MONICA CARRERA, M.D.
J. LUIS MARTINEZ, M.D., PH.D.
M. ISABEL RODRÍGUEZ, M.D., PH.D.
Málaga, Spain

Comment on Hoarding

TO THE EDITOR: The intriguing report by Sanjaya Saxena, M.D., et al. on hoarding (1) prompts me to write concerning what I believe is a significant defect in DSM-IV-TR regarding persons who primarily present with hoarding.

My own experience with hoarders is based on having performed close to 800 guardianship evaluations over the last 15 years. Guardianship evaluations are generally performed as home visits. The high prevalence of hoarding in this group is notable.

Dr. Saxena et al. included hoarders within obsessive-compulsive disorder (OCD). Our diagnostic manual defines compulsions as "repetitive behaviors" and gives examples that all have an active motoric or cognitive component. The actions or mental acts "reduce anxiety." Hoarding, I believe, usually arises from inaction. The only anxiety I have observed is when hoarders are threatened by forced clearing. The problem is not so much that these people collect. The problem is that they are unable to discard.

Hoarding in DSM-IV-TR appears only in the description of obsessive-compulsive personality disorder. The "differential diagnosis" for obsessive-compulsive personality disorder does state that OCD should be diagnosed when hoarding is "extreme." Thus, "extreme" hoarding is OCD, and less than "extreme" hoarding is obsessive-compulsive personality disorder. The clinician is further frustrated by being referred to the OCD section but finds the DSM-IV-TR section on OCD totally silent in respect to hoarding. Although DSM-IV-TR accommodates a dual diagnosis of OCD and obsessive-compulsive personality disorder, it clearly discourages diagnosing both conditions: "the clinical manifestations of these disorders are quite different" (p. 462).

One of the significant findings by Dr. Saxena et al. is that there is an anatomic locus for the syndrome of hoarding. This certainly should lead us to conclude that the one place hoarding does not belong is among "personality disorders." Hoarding needs to be explicitly embraced under OCD. To do this, the basic definitions of OCD may need to be modified.

An alternative suggestion is to regard hoarding syndromes as independent of OCD and as part of a new grouping of diagnostic entities titled "disorders of executive function."

Reference

1. Saxena S, Brody AL, Maidment KM, Smith EC, Zohrabi N, Katz E, Baker SK, Baxter LR Jr: Cerebral glucose metabolism in obsessive-compulsive hoarding. *Am J Psychiatry* 2004; 161:1038–1048

MARK A. AMDUR, M.D.
Chicago, Ill.

Dr. Saxena Replies

TO THE EDITOR: My associates and I thank Dr. Amdur for his comments on our recent publication. His letter raises several important issues regarding the diagnostic classification of the compulsive hoarding syndrome.

We agree with Dr. Amdur's contention that compulsive hoarding should be removed from the diagnostic criteria for obsessive-compulsive personality disorder. Only 15%–45% of hoarders meet criteria for obsessive-compulsive personality disorder (1, 2). No correlation was found between hoarding

severity and scores on an obsessive-compulsive personality disorder scale (3). Instead, hoarding behaviors correlate significantly with other OCD symptoms (3).

Dr. Amdur suggests that compulsive hoarders may not meet DSM-IV-TR criteria for OCD because they appear to suffer more from their inaction than from repetitive behaviors. However, compulsive hoarders have been found to have many repetitive acquisition and saving behaviors (3). While DSM-IV-TR does not explicitly mention compulsive hoarding as a symptom of OCD, hoarding and saving-related obsessions and compulsions are quite common in patients with OCD (4, 5) and are included in standard OCD assessments, such as the Yale-Brown Obsessive Compulsive Scale symptom checklist (6). Dr. Amdur observes that compulsive hoarders do not appear to have anxiety unless they are threatened by forced clearing, but several studies have found elevated anxiety levels in compulsive hoarders, even in comparison to nonhoarding OCD patients (7, 8). Moreover, hoarders also report a high prevalence of nonhoarding obsessions and compulsions (2, 3) and do not differ from nonhoarding OCD patients in the number of OCD symptoms reported on the Yale-Brown Obsessive Compulsive Scale checklist or overall score (7, 8).

Nevertheless, the question remains: Should compulsive hoarding be classified as a symptom subtype of OCD or as a separate disorder that is frequently comorbid with OCD? Factors that support a separate classification include significant differences between hoarders and nonhoarding OCD patients in comorbidity and family history (2), response to serotonin reuptake inhibitors (9), and the distinct functional brain abnormalities found in our recent study. Neuropsychological, brain imaging, and genetic studies comparing compulsive hoarders to nonhoarding OCD patients will be required to resolve this issue.

References

1. Winsberg ME, Cassic KS, Koran LM: Hoarding in obsessive-compulsive disorder: a report of 20 cases. *J Clin Psychiatry* 1999; 60:591–597
2. Samuels J, Bienvenu OJ, Riddle MA, Cullen BAM, Grados MA, Liang KY, Hoehn-Saric R, Nestadt G: Hoarding in obsessive-compulsive disorder: results from a case-control study. *Behav Res Ther* 2002; 40:517–528
3. Frost RO, Gross RC: The hoarding of possessions. *Behav Res Ther* 1993; 31:367–381
4. Rasmussen S, Eisen JL: The epidemiology and clinical features of obsessive-compulsive disorder. *Psychiatr Clin North Am* 1992; 15:743–758
5. Hanna GL: Demographic and clinical features of obsessive-compulsive disorder in children and adolescents. *J Am Acad Child Adolesc Psychiatry* 1995; 34:19–27
6. Goodman WK, Price LH, Rasmussen SA, Mazure C, Fleischmann RL, Hill CL, Heninger GR, Charney DS: The Yale-Brown Obsessive Compulsive Scale, I: development, use, and reliability. *Arch Gen Psychiatry* 1989; 46:1006–1011
7. Frost RO, Steketee G, Williams LF, Warren R: Mood, personality disorder symptoms, and disability in obsessive compulsive hoarders: a comparison with clinical and non-clinical controls. *Behav Res Ther* 2000; 38:1071–1081
8. Saxena S, Maidment KM, Vapnik T, Golden G, Rishwain T, Rosen RM, Tarlow G, Bystritsky A: Obsessive-compulsive hoarding: symptom severity and response to multi-modal treatment. *J Clin Psychiatry* 2002; 63:21–27
9. Mataix-Cols D, Rauch SL, Manzo PA, Jenike MA, Baer L: Use of factor-analyzed symptom dimensions to predict outcome with serotonin reuptake inhibitors and placebo in the treatment of obsessive-compulsive disorder. *Am J Psychiatry* 1999; 156:1409–1416

SANJAYA SAXENA, M.D.
Los Angeles, Calif.

Reprints are not available; however, Letters to the Editor can be downloaded at <http://ajp.psychiatryonline.org>.